

03
51A

UNITED STATES GOVERNMENT

Memorandum

TO : 001 *Noted*
7/10

JAG:104:RWG:srw
DATE: 24 January 1975

FROM : 10

SUBJECT: Covenant with the Marianas

- Encl: (1) ASD memorandum for Ambassador F. Hadyn Williams of 23 Jan 1975
 (2) JAG memorandum for Captain Whelan of 15 Jan 1975

1. Enclosure (1) is partially in response to your memorandum to the Chief of Naval Operations. The resemblance between it and enclosure (2), earlier provided to Captain Whelan by this Office, is striking. Most of the comments included in enclosure (1) pertaining to Section 806 of the Covenant were earlier made by this Office in a separate memorandum to Mr. Harry Almond of the Office of General Counsel, Department of Defense.

Very respectfully,

Richard L. Fruchtman, Jr.

RICHARD L. FRUCHTERMAN, Jr.
Captain, JAG, U.S. Navy



Trust Terr. Marianas - Base & Fee Navy

07: 413090

15 Jan 1975

MEMORANDUM FOR CAPTAIN WHELAN, USN, ASSISTANT FOR TTPI (OASD/ISA)

Subj: Draft Covenant for a Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands;
comments upon

Ref: (a) Subject draft attached to Mr. Abramowitz' Memo of 3 Jan 1975
for the General Counsel

1. Pursuant to your request, the following comments are offered on the
subject draft Covenant attached to reference (a).

2. Preamble

Recommendation: In line 1 of the first paragraph, substitute "Nations"
for "States".

Reason: To correct obvious error.

Recommendation: In line 2 of the second paragraph, delete "inalienable".

Reason: The people of the Marianas will exercise their right of self-
determination in the plebescite prescribed in the Covenant. If they
decide to join "in political union with and under the sovereignty of the
United States of America" (Article 101), their only remaining right of
self-determination will be as part of that larger corporate body; they
will no longer have a separate right of self-determination which could,
at their unilateral option, permit them to sever their ties with the
United States. Thus, the term "inalienable" is legally inaccurate.

3. Section 105.

Recommendation: In the third line of the first sentence place a
period after "Islands", and delete the remainder of that sentence beginning
with "so long as...." Add a new second sentence as follows: "Legislation
not generally applicable to the States of the United States, and which

07413091

Islands, shall not be applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands." In the second line of the last sentence, delete "its" before "authority"; after "authority" add "to enact legislation applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands."

Reason: To state the intent of this section with greater clarity.

4. Section 203(c).

Recommendation: To the end of the first sentence, after "legislation", add the words "not otherwise inconsistent with the supreme law of the Northern Mariana Islands as defined in Section 102."

Reason: The recommended language points to the standard by which "rightful subjects" are determined. It is also more consistent with the *formula for the granted* legislative power *of the Guam Legislature. Legislature.*

5. Section 501.

Recommendation: In the last line, after "Islands", insert "only with the approval of the Government of the Northern Mariana Islands".

Reason: To correct inadvertent omission from earlier draft of Covenant.

6. Section 502.

Recommendation: In line three place a colon after "Islands" and delete the remainder of lines three and four; in subsection (a) add "except as otherwise provided in this Covenant" after those clauses in which the legislation described is modified by sections in the Covenant, e.g., after "Social Security Act..."

Reason: "as follows" is redundant. The exception proviso in its present location applies to all three subsections even though it was not

413092

intended so to limit all legislation made applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands. For example, federal legislation made applicable through subsection (b) includes sections 105-110 of 4 U.S.C., which permits states and territories to collect sales, use and income taxes from persons within Federal areas while protecting from such taxes sales by the U.S. Government and its instrumentalities, and the Soldiers and Sailors Civil Relief Act of 1940, as amended (50 U.S.C. Appendix sec. 501ff), which grants various protections to servicemen including protection from various taxes by states or territories other than their domicile. Subsequent provisions of the Compact, notably sections 602, 603(b) and 604(b), confer upon the GNMI various taxing powers similar to the taxing powers of a state. The cited federal legislation protects the federal government and its military personnel from the exercise of those state powers to tax within the states, but, ironically, the exception proviso as presently located, could nullify that federal legislation and give the GNMI a taxing power over federal activities and military personnel greater than that enjoyed by the States. More judicious locating of the exception proviso would solve this particular problem.

7. Section 602.

Recommendation: In the second line place a comma after "appropriate" and insert "and which are not otherwise inconsistent with the laws of the United States applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands,".

Reason: Section 602 grants a very broad tax power to the GNMI, which is probably a very valuable asset for its political development. Language should be included, however, to insure that this Section, which is part

of the supreme law of the Northern Mariana Islands under Section 102, does not serve as justification and support for local exercises of the taxing power inconsistent with federal law applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands, which is also part of the supreme law under Section 102. The inclusion of the recommended language would merely ensure that the GNMI, in its exercise of its taxing power, was subject to ~~these~~ restraints analogous to those placed by federal legislation upon the States of the Union with regard to their own taxing powers.

8. Section 603(b).

Recommendation: In the second line of this subsection, after "United States", add the following language: "and not otherwise inconsistent with the law of the United States applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands."

Reason: The present language appears to permit the imposition by the GNMI of customs duties on imports from areas outside the customs territory of the United States and on exports from its territory both for U.S. Governmental agencies located in the Marianas and for their personnel present in the Marianas solely by reason of their employment or military orders. Normally the imposition of such taxes within the United States on agencies of the Federal Government is avoided by the Federal immunity from state and territorial taxes while military personnel are protected by the Soldiers and Sailors Civil Relief Act. Under Section 102 of the Covenant, however, the provisions of the Covenant and federal laws applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands are both parts of the supreme law of the NMI, and presumably of equal authority. Commonwealth legislation imposing a customs duty on articles imported by the U.S. Government or its instrumentalities, or on household effects imported

by servicemen stationed in the NMI would raise a conflict between these two segments of the supreme law of the Marianas. Since the Covenant will be the most recent in ^{Time,} ~~Time,~~ a court could decide that the intent was to override those sections of federal legislation ~~with which it is~~ inconsistent ^{with the Covenant.} The recommended change obviates this risk.

9. Section 604(b).

Recommendation: At the conclusion of this subsection, after "United States", add the following words: "and not otherwise inconsistent with the law of the United States applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands."

Reason: As given in the preceding paragraph. It may be noted that the Government of Guam, which lacks authority for imposing customs levies, does levy a use tax on the purchase and consumption of goods in Guam. In the past the Government of Guam has attempted to collect that tax on liquor purchased in the United States and sold in Navy exchange package stores in Guam and upon household goods shipments of military personnel present in Guam under military orders. Both 603(b) and 604(b) recognize that the taxing authority conferred must be limited so as to be consistent with the international obligations of the United States. It would appear important also to limit that authority by requiring consistency with the laws of the United States applicable to the Northern Mariana Islands.

10. Section 802(b).

Recommendation: Revise Section 802(b) to read: "(b) The United States affirms that it has no present need for or present intention to acquire any property additional to that which is listed in subparagraph (a), or to acquire any greater interest in the property leased by the United States under subparagraph (a), in order to carry out its defense responsibilities."

Reason: The present language of Section 802(b), along with certain features of Sections 803(a) and 806(a) and (c), can be read as basing the USG right of eminent domain on the Covenant, rather than ^{upon} the U.S. Consti-

413096

a leasehold interest. While this is certainly not the more probable interpretation of these sections, its tenuous nature is given more substance by indications ^{that} this is the interpretation held by the legal advisers to the Marianan delegation. The change recommended to 802(b), and the following changes recommended to Sections 803(a) and 806(a) and (c) eliminate the slight support for such an interpretation adverse to USG interests by eliminating any ambiguity on this question.

Recommendation: In the second line of Section 803(a), after "Section 802" insert "(a)".

Recommendation: In the third line of Section 806(a), before "real property", insert "parcels of"; in that same line delete "transferred to it under" and substitute "listed in".

Recommendation. In the second and third lines of Section 806(c), delete "will have and".

11. Section 804(b).

Recommendation: In the fifth line of Section 804(c), after "substantial," revise the remainder of the subsection as follows: "the United States Government shall make a fair and reasonable contribution to the cost of operating and maintaining the facilities, the amount of such contribution being determined by agreement between the Government of the United States and the Government of the Northern Mariana Islands."

Reason: The present text could be construed as permitting the Government of the Northern Mariana Islands unilaterally to determine the charge which the United States Government should pay in the event that there is substantial use of Isely Field by military and naval aircraft. The change recommended clarifies that the amount to be paid by the United

413097

States Government is a matter for negotiation.

12. Section 805.

Recommendation: Revise lines 10 through 13 to read as follows:

"the acquisition of such interests to citizens of the Northern Mariana Islands and may regulate the extent to which and conditions by which a person may acquire or hold public land."

Reason: Two changes are accomplished by this recommendation. First, more precise description of those persons eligible to acquire permanent and long term interests is accomplished. Second, provision is made for land which, though not now public, may become public in the future.